Case 08-35653-KRH Doc 4888 Filed 09/15/09 Entered 09/15/09 13:28:41 Desc Main Document Page 1 of 10

Paul S. Bliley, Jr., VSB #13973

Williams Mullen
P.O. Box 1320

Richmond, VA 23218-1320

Telephone: (804) 783-6448

Fax: (804) 783-6507

pbliley@williamsmullen.com
Counsel to Hee County, Florida Tax Collector

IN THE UNITED STATES BANKRUPTCY COURT EASTERN DISTRICT OF VIRGINIA Richmond Division

IN RE:) Chapter 11
) Case No. 08-35653 (KRH)
CIRCUIT CITY STORES, INC., et al.,)
, , ,) Jointly Administered
Debtors.)

RESPONSE OF HONORABLE CATHY CURTIS, TAX COLLECTOR IN AND FOR LEE COUNTY, FLORIDA ("TAX COLLECTOR") TO DEBTOR'S THIRTY-SEVENTH OMNIBUS OBJECTION TO CLAIMS (REDUCTION OF CERTAIN PERSONAL PROPERTY TAX CLAIMS)

Comes now the Honorable Cathy Curtis, Tax Collector in and for Lee County, Florida ("Tax Collector"), and for her response to the Debtor's Thirty-Seventh Omnibus Objection to Claims (Reduction of Certain Personal Property Tax Claims) (Docket #4613) states as follows:

- 1. The Claimant's Name is the Honorable Cathy Curtis, Tax Collector in and for Lee County, Florida ("Tax Collector"). The amount of the claim filed is for 2009 personal property taxes assessed against the personal property of Circuit City Stores located at 1811-1847 NE Pine Island Rd., Cape Coral, Florida and 4300/4380 Cleveland Ave., Fort Myers, Florida, as of January 1, 2009.
- 2. Attached hereto as Exhibit A is a concise statement of Tax Collector, who is a person with personal knowledge of the relevant facts in support of this response, which statement

sets forth the reasons why the Bankruptcy Court should overrule the objection as to the Tax Collector's claim, which includes, without limitation the specific factual and legal basis upon which the claimant intends to rely in support of her response and her underlying claim.

- 3. Attached hereto as Exhibit B is a copy of or identification of documentation supporting the Tax Collector's claim that the claimant presently intends to introduce into evidence in support of her claim at any hearing held on this objection. Claimant reserves the right to supplement this documentation at a later date if additional supporting documentation is obtained.
- 4. Attached hereto as Exhibit C is a Declaration of the Honorable Kenneth Wilkinson who is the Property Appraiser in and for Lee County, Florida and as such has personal knowledge of the relevant facts that support this response.
- 5. The claimants address, telephone number, fax number and the claimant's attorney to whom the attorneys for the Debtor should serve a reply to the response are as follows:

The Hon. Cathy Curtis Lee County Tax Collector 2480 Thompson Street Fort Myers, Florida 33902 Phone: (239) 533-6000 Fax: (2389) 533-6065

Attorney:
Paul S. Bliley, Jr., Esquire
Williams Mullen
P.O. Box 1320
Richmond, VA 23218-1320
pbliley@williamsmullen.com
Telephone: (804) 783-6448

Fax: (804) 783-6507

6. The name, address, telephone number and fax number of the party to reconcile, settle or otherwise resolve the objection on the claimant's behalf is the attorney set forth above.

Case 08-35653-KRH Doc 4888 Filed 09/15/09 Entered 09/15/09 13:28:41 Desc Main Document Page 3 of 10

Dated: September 15, 2009

Hon. Cathy Curtis, Tax Collector In and for Lee County, Florida

By /s/ Paul S. Bliley, Jr.
Of Counsel

Paul S. Bliley, Jr., VSB No. 13973 Williams Mullen P.O. Box 1320 Richmond, VA 23218-1320

Phone:

(804) 783-6448

Fax:

(804) 783-6507

pbliley@williamsmullen.com

Counsel for Tax Collector in and for Lee County, Florida

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on the Little day of September 2009, I caused a copy of the foregoing to be served by electronic means on the "2002" and "Core" lists and through the ECF system.

/s/ Paul S. Bliley, Jr.
Paul S. Bliley, Jr.

6799216_1.DOC

EXHIBIT A

I have personal knowledge as the Tax Collector for Lee County, Florida, to the relevant facts in support of the Response of the Tax Collector to the Objection filed. The Court should overrule the Objection as to the claim of the Tax Collector, factually and legally.

The factual basis is as set forth in Exhibit C prepared by the Honorable Kenneth Wilkinson, Property Appraiser in and for Lee County, Florida, who had appraised the Circuit City property upon which the Tax Collector, by law, must rely.

The legal basis is because Florida law in Section 197.332, Florida Statutes, restricts the Tax Collector to the collection of all taxes as shown on the tax roll. The tax roll, indicating the value of the property and the amount of tax assessed on such property, is prepared by the Property Appraiser as required in Section 192.011, Florida Statutes. This restriction on the Tax Collector's duties is provided further in the applicable rules prepared by the Florida Department of Revenue (which supervises both the Property Appraiser and the Tax Collector in the state work performed locally in each county political subdivision), throughout Chapter 12D-13, Florida Administrative Code.

The Honorable Cathy Curtis
Lee County Tax Collector

EXHIBIT B

Attached hereto is the roll and appraised values received by the Tax Collector from the Property Appraiser. Attached also is the documentation of the Property Appraiser as referenced in Exhibit C.

2009 NOTICE OF AD VALOREM TAXES DUE FOR LEE COUNTY, FLORIDA

OWNER NAME AND ADDRESS

ACCOUNT NUMBER 88-00-2034-03 BIZ

VALUES AND EXEMPTIONS ASSESSED VALUE

710440 710440

CIRCUIT CITY STORES INC ATTN SCOTT ASH TAX MANAGER P O BOX 42304 RICHMOND VA 23242

PERSONAL ID NUMBER 09-00000504 SITE ADDRESS

LEGAL DESCRIPTION PARGEL ID: 05-44-24-04-01580.0010

06/05/2009 DISTRICT: 057 AD VALOREM TAXES LEVIED AMOUNT TELEPHONE MULTIRLIER TAXING AUTHORITY MILL RATE

Tangible Personal

TOTAL FOR AD VALOREM:

41 Disc:\$\$87.36 DISC POIN, SO. OO Taxi:Due:512106,39 Pd rp Dare:\$0:00

Prorated

Apr. Duc:531690.93

Tax Year: 2009

Change of malling address? See reverse side.

06/05/2009

HOLD HOLD

近れたが出

が土土地

中中的一种

Tangible Tax Notice

Lee County Tax Collector PC Box 1609 Fort Myers, FU 33902

PhoneiEmail Contact:

CIRCUIT CITY STORES INC ATTN SCOTT ASH TAX MANAGER P.O.BOX 12304: RICHMOND VA 23242

ACCOUNT: BB:00-2034;03: BIZ SITE:ADDRESS1 PERSONAL ID:NUMBER: 09:00008584

For payment oplions and instructions refer to the back of this notice and any enclosures.

IF PAID IMMEDIATELY AMOUNT DUE \$11698.93

Make check payable lot LEE COUNTY TAX COLLECTOR POBOX 1009 FT MYERS FL 303023609

dededs

20095

E0020340300000003

IMPORTANT INSTRUCTIONS AND INFORMATION - PLEASE READ

- 1. Ad Valorem Taxes cover the period January 1 through December 31 of the lax year indicated on the front of this notice. Tax notices are mailed on or about November 1 and pecome delinquent April 1. Fallure to receive a tax notice does not extend discounts or excuse taxpayers' responsibilities to pay taxes and applicable penalties for late payments. Informational notices are mailed when taxes are "escrowed" and a mortgage holder/agent requests the tax notice for payment. Installment tax notices are mailed in June, September, December and March.
- Verify the mailing address, site address, legal description, assessed values and exemptions. Report any discrepancies immediately to the Lee County Property Appraise.
- 3. Property Sold: Forward this notice to the new owner(s).
- 4. Discounts: The amounts indicated on the front of this notice represent the total laxes and assessments due (if applicable) less discounts allowed for early payment according to the following schedule: 4% in November 3% in December, 2% in January; and 1% in February. Installment payment discounts are according to the following schedule: 6% in June: 4-1/2% in September, and 3% in December.
- 5. Payment Options: Bank account and credit card payments are accepted online at www.leetc.com and through our Automated Telephone System (239) 332:8731. Credit card payments are charged a 1.75% service fee on the total amount due. No portion of the service fee is relained by the Tax Collector's Office.

 By Mail: Return the payment coupons with the amount due by check (personal/business/cashler) or money order. In Person: Cash, check (personal/business/cashler), debit card or money order.
- Confirm Payment: Confirm receipt of your payment through our Web site www.leetc.com or call our Automated Telephone System
 (239) 332-8731. Your taxes are not pour until your payment clears the bank. For a validated receipt include a self-addressed slamped
 envelope. Otherwise, your cancel or call the bank of the bank.
- Delinquent Taxes: Payment of delinquent taxes must be made in certified U.S. funds drawn on a U.S. bank. The amount due is determined
 by the date payment is received. Fallure to pay delinquent taxes could result in the loss of your property. On April 1, the following charges are
 imposed by Florida Law.

Real Estate: 3% minimum mandatory interest and cost of advertising. A tax certificate sale is held on or before June 1, resulting in additional charges.

Tangible Personal Property: 18% interest annually, cost of advertising and lees. Tax warrants will be issued on all unpaid personal property laxes on or about August 1, resulting in additional charges.

8. GOVERNMENTAL DEFICE RESPONSIBILITIES:

Taxing/Lévying Authority: Establish millage rates and assessments based on tax revenue needed for operating expenses. Contact the authority is a later from the figure for questions on services provided or rates charged.

Properfy:Appreliser: Prepares and certifies the tax roll including property values, exemptions, and legal description; assessed owner(s) name and mailing address to the Tax collector; Contact the Lee County Property-Appreliserity on have questions regarding the certified lax roll at Pro. Box 1546; Fort Myers Fig. 33002; www.leeps.org.or (239) 533-6100; Office hours 8:30 AM to 5:00 PM Manday. Friday, exception holiday (beings)

Tax Collector: Prints mails and collects payments based on the tax roll(s) certified by the Property Appraiser and Taxing/Levying Authorities. Contact the Lee County has Collector for questions concerning payment of taxes at P.O. Box 1609, Fort Myers, P.L. 33902, www.leetc.com. or (239) 533-6000. Office hours: 8:30 AM to 5:00 PM Monday - Filday, except for holiday closings.

:-:-:			The second of th	AND THE REAL PROPERTY AND THE PARTY AND THE	
	1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1		ann mite i traff i frei a tht ff ter	### #### ### 1995 1975 1976	đ١
Le .	- 一 は 1世を出したもまして、3000	Ann the matter	113 600 11 611 31 611 13157 1 3113	3111 1481 £ 568 471 N 1461 £ 131 £	ı.
and the second residence of the second	- 立文化伊尼 斯/第 一张 是重要的多数的	N 41 -1-4	:		1
מחחכח יו	of Mailing	MATTOR	4 2 124 125 13 15 15 15 15 15 15 1	1101E # 61E 1831 PAIN & ELFO 1817	п
CHOLICE.			- CLATHECTERETARK BURN AND	1741 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	il.
	1 . 100 6 Lat 1 Co. Mark			RED 14113 6:21 6310 1511 1 1213	и.

To change your mailting address complete this form and return it with your payment. Your request will be forwarded to the Broperty Apprelser who is responsible for all address changes to the tex roll.

We recommend you contact the Lee County Property Appraiser at P.O. Box 1546, Eqd Myers, F <u>your leeps or</u> , to confirm completion of your request. Allow 3-4 weeks processing time. Failure	L 33902, (239)533:6 (00 of visit their Webielle e to receive a lax notice does not extend discounts.
PLEASE PRINT - Bo not use this form to change your address if you receive Ho	mestead Exemption for this property.
Named]
Street or P.O. Box Number: 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	TITLLE LEGISTE
Signature:	Date:

2009 NOTICE OF AD VALOREM TAXES DUE FOR LEE COUNTY, FLORIDA

OWNER NAME AND ADDRESS CIRCUIT CITY STORES INC SCOTT ASH TAX MANAGER PO BOX 42304 RICHMOND VA 232/12

ACCOUNT NUMBER 09-00-2034-57 BIZ

SITE ADDRESS

PERSONAL ID NUMBER 09-00008585

VALUES AND EXEMPTIONS ASSESSED VALUE

550540 550540

LEGAL DESCRIPTION PARCEL ID: 35-44-24-P3-02100,0190

06/05/2009 DISTRICT: 246 AD VALOREM TAXES LEVIED TELEPHONE AMOUNT MULTIPLIER MILLRATE TAXING AUTHORITY

Tangible Personal

TOTAL FOR AD VALOREME

Pa to Dite so ud Tax Duc (\$11603.46

oise Pald:\$0.00

Prorated

Ar placisact.14

Ame Duc:511139:32

Tax Year: 2009

Change of mailing address 2 See roverse side.

06/05/2009

A O H

RECOUNT I

HAGTE

い上たり

P

可为自己的

Tangible Tax Notice

Lee County Tax Collector PO Box 1609 Fort Myers, FL 33902

Phone/Email Contact)

CIRCUIT GITY STORES INC SCOTT ASH TAX MANAGER PO BOX 42304 RICHMOND VA 23242

ACCOUNT: BB-00-2034-67 BIZ SITE ADDRESS: BERSONAL ID NUMBER: 09-00008585

For payment options and instructions refer to the back of this nolice and any Enclosures.

FPAID IMMEDIATELY AMOUNT DUE \$11139.32

Make check payable to: LEE COUNTY TAX COLLECTOR PIO BOX 1609 FT MYERS IL 33902-1609

liilladkilallaabkallallallabkilladdalah

020205

20095

880020946700000005

EXHIBIT C

Declaration of the Honorable Kenneth Wilkinson, Property Appraiser in and for Lee County, Florida.

As the Property Appraiser in and for the Lee County political subdivision, I appraise the value of property pursuant to state law and state rule and work under the supervision of the Florida Department of Revenue in this regard as provided in Section 195.002(1), Florida Statutes. Pursuant to Section 193.114, Florida Statutes, I prepared the Tangible Personal Property Tax Rolls for the year 2008 and upon certification delivered such roll to the Tax Collector in and for Lee County, Florida.

Attached is the Certificate to Roll for the year 2008 which indicates when the roll was certified, who it was prepared by, and that it was delivered to the Tax Collector for collection.

The Honorable Kenneth Wilkinson Lee County Property Appraiser

NEWS-PRESS

Published every morning – Daily and Sunday Fort Myers, Florida

Affidavit of Publication

STATE OF FLORIDA COUNTY OF LEE

Before the undersigned authority, personally appeared

Valerie Daeda

who on oath says that he/she is the

<u>Legal Assistant</u> of the News-Press, a daily newspaper, published at Fort Myers, in Lee County, Florida; that the attached copy of advertisement, being a

Public Notice

In the matter of

Certificate To Roll

In the court was published in said newspaper in the issues of

May 5th , 2009

Affiant further says that the said News-Press is a paper of general circulation daily in Lee, Charlotte, Collier, Glades and Hendry Counties and published at Fort Myers, in said Lee County, Florida and that said newspaper has heretofore been continuously published in said Lee County; Florida, each day, and has been entered as a second class mail matter at the post office in Fort Myers in said Lee County, Florida, for a period of one year next preceding the first publication of the attached copy of the advertisement; and affiant further says that he/she has neither paid nor promised any person, firm or corporation any discount, rebate, commission or refund for the purpose of securing this advertisement for publication in the said newspaper.

Sworn to and subscribed before me this

5th day of May, 2009 by

Valerie Daeda

personally known to me or who has produced

as identification, and who did or did not take an

oath.

Notary Public

Print Name

GLYDYS D. VANDERBECK Commission DD 826805

Expires December 13, 2012
Bonded Thru Troy Fain Insurance 800-885-7019

My commission Expires:

CERTIFICATE TO ROLL

I, the undersigned, hereby certify that I am the duly qualified and acting Property Appraiser in and for Lee County, Florida: As such, I have satisfied myself that all property included or includable on the Real and Tangible Personal Property Assessment Roll for the aforesaid county is properly taxed so far as I have been able to ascertain. That the said Roll was extended on the 15th day of October 2008, prior to the completion of the Value Adjustment Board hearings dated the 27th of February 2009, pursuant to ES 197 323(1), and that the said roll was certified and delivered to me by the Value Adjustment Board on the 28th day of April 2009, and that all required extensions to the above-described Roll to show the tax attributable to all taxable property included therein have been made pursuant to law.

I further certify that upon completion of this Certificate and the attachment of same to the herein described Assessment Roll as a part thereof, that said Assessment Roll was delivered to the Tax Collector of this county on the 15th day of October 2008.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have subscribed this Certificate and caused the same to be attached to and made a part of the described Assessment Roll this the 5th day of May 2009

KENNETH M. WILKINSON, C.FA

Property Appraiser of Lee County, Florida